

Assembly Minority Task Force on LEARNING FOR WORK

Assembly Minority Leader Will Barclay

Task Force Co-Chairs
Assemblyman Ken Blankenbush Assemblyman Mike Norris

2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTORY LETTER	
FROM TASK FORCE CO-CHAIRMEN	I
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	2
REMOVING THE BOCES STIGMA	4
ENHANCING THE BOCES EXPERIENCE	6
EXPANDING & ENHANCING P-TECH	9
EXPLORING CHANGES IN HIGHER EDUCATION	12
REMOVING BUREAUCRATIC BARRIERS	16
LEARNING FOR WORK LEGISLATIVE CHANGES	20
RECOMMENDATIONS & SOLUTIONS	22
TASK FORCE EVENTS	25



INTRODUCTORY LETTER

FROM THE TASK FORCE CO-CHAIRMEN

During the fall of 2019, at six regional forums, the Assembly Minority Task Force on Learning for Work sought input from members of the public as well as educational, trade, and industrial leaders about the economic and educational impacts of this program.

In addition to learning more about the existing middle-skills, or perhaps more appropriately termed "professional-skills," gaps in the State, the task force was curious to hear from stakeholders about the best ways to transition students from high school into the workplace in order to ensure they possess the skills required to obtain a career in the trade or field of their choosing.

The testimony and expertise gathered was used to develop a new package of proposals to ensure all students are prepared to enter the 21st century workforce.

Unfortunately, before the task force was able to present its findings and legislative solutions, the COVID-19 pandemic arrived, disrupting lives around the globe. In New York, sadly, our schools closed, businesses shuttered, and residents lost their jobs. Almost overnight, parents and employers across the State realized how critically their lives and livelihoods revolved around the education system. Nearly two years later, people are beginning to return to their daily routines and a sense of normalcy, especially our children.

The pandemic changed the landscape of our lives, and further illustrated our State's economic health, viability, and competitiveness depends on a well-trained, skilled workforce. We must be better equipped at preparing today's students for tomorrow's workforce – they will be skilled; they will be ready; and they will be tomorrow's leaders.

According to the National Skills Coalition, middle-skill jobs make up the largest portion of New York's labor market. While 49% of all jobs available throughout New York in 2018 were middle-skill, only 37% of the State's workers were trained for the positions. In order to begin discussions on how to address this "middle-skills gap," the Assembly Minority Conference introduced the "Learning for Work Program," a three-part program designed to train high-school aged New Yorkers for local jobs that are available right now (A.8426, Walczyk).

We look forward to sharing the Assembly Minority Conference's findings with Governor Hochul and her administration, our colleagues in the Assembly and Senate, and the stakeholders who so kindly shared with us their personal and professional experiences and input. Your patience throughout this endeavor is greatly appreciated.

Sincerely,

Assemblyman Ken Blankenbush

Ken Blanfenbus

117th Assembly District

Muchael J Nonio Assemblyman Mike Norris 144th Assembly District

1 https://www.nationalskillscoalition.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/12/NY-Skills-Mismatch-Fact-Sheet-2020.pdf



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Even prior to the COVID-19 pandemic, New York State found itself at an economic crossroads. From 2019 to 2020, New York's population continued to decline more than any state in the nation,² with multiple downstate counties at unemployment rates above six percent.³ Employers are struggling to fill open jobs, especially those labeled as "middle-skill" (jobs requiring more than a high school education but less than a four-year degree); we must do more to expand opportunities in all corners of the State.

Middle-skill jobs (which will be referred to as professional-skill jobs throughout the rest of this report to accurately reflect the true nature of these careers) make up the largest portion of New York's labor market.⁴ However, fewer and fewer young New Yorkers are being trained to fill these available positions. This is creating a dangerous skills-gap where the trade workers who have filled these jobs for decades are reaching retirement age with no one with the skills required to replace them joining the workforce.

Overall, there are 2.7 million student loan borrowers in New York State with debt totaling \$99.8 billion.⁵ At a time when many young New Yorkers interested in pursuing jobs will attend college, New York State should be doing all it can to increase access to successful training or apprenticeship programs to help reduce the amount of student loan debt. Unfortunately, trying to navigate the State's complex web of workforce development and training programs is nearly impossible. While many programs exist in our high schools, higher education institutions, and through public and non-profit training providers, more can be done to improve the end result for today's students, who are tomorrow's workforce.

In order to start the conversation on how to begin preparing our workforce for available professional-skill jobs, the Assembly Minority Conference introduced the Learning for Work Program (A.8426, Walczyk). This three-part program would bring together local businesses, school districts, and workforce development professionals to provide a youth apprenticeship program in our high schools that leads to a degree with a designation in a specified field. The Learning for Work Program includes a youth apprenticeship program emphasizing a hands-on learning experience in concert with local businesses designed to enhance skills for students and

 $^{2\} https://www.usatoday.com/story/news/politics/2020/12/23/new-york-population-decline-coronavirus-house-seats/4023477001/$

³ https://statistics.labor.ny.gov/lslaus.shtm

⁴ https://www.nationalskillscoalition.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/12/NY-Skills-Mismatch-Fact-Sheet-2020.pdf

⁵ https://studentloanhero.com/featured/how-to-get-or-refinance-new-york-student-loans/

Executive Summary

provide a pipeline of workers to companies doing business in our State. The program, based on experiences in other states such as Wisconsin and South Carolina, is a career mentorship concept that would provide students with the opportunity to cultivate a relationship with individuals in a professional field of interest through a multi-faceted program.

As a result of our desire to focus on work-based learning programs, the Assembly Minority Conference, led by Co-Chairmen Ken Blankenbush and Mike Norris, created the Learning for Work Task Force. In the fall of 2019, the task force held six forums across New York State and engaged with stakeholders including local school administrators, teachers, students, industry partners, local labor unions, non-profits, BOCES administrators, and private apprentice institutions to find out what can be done to help prepare young New Yorkers for jobs that are available right now. The input from these individuals and organizations on the front lines of the growing professional-skills gap established several consistent themes in terms of possible legislative remedies to address both the professional-skills gap in general and specific apprenticeship program issues in New York State. Issues including BOCES rebranding, increased apprenticeship program access and awareness, changes to higher education, and consolidated authority and uniformity from State agencies have demonstrated the need for both legislative action and new, balanced leadership from New York State.

Since the task force events initially took place, and before the task force was able to present its findings and legislative solutions, the COVID-19 pandemic began, exposing even more cracks in the State's already fragile economy, and delaying our ability to report on what we learned. Schools closed, businesses shuttered, and people lost their jobs. New York's unemployment rate reached a staggering high of 16.2% in April 2020, and while it dropped to 7.6% in July 2021, the State still had the second highest unemployment rate in the country; trailing only Nevada.⁶

The following report details the issues discussed at task force events, suggestions from those who testified, and solutions that will begin moving New York in a new direction where interested students can be prepared to enter the career of their choice.





REMOVING THE BOCES STIGMA

Boards of Cooperative Educational Services (BOCES) are comprised of component school districts, paid for and organized by the contributing districts. Currently, New York has 37 BOCES districts, representing all of New York State except for the Big 5 city school districts (NYC, Buffalo, Rochester, Yonkers, and Syracuse). Each BOCES district has the ability to establish its own unique curriculum, following certain criteria determined by the Commissioner of Education. BOCES often provide non-standard educational services such as Career and Technical Education (CTE), adult services education, and special education beyond what ordinary schools can provide. Due to BOCES being a cooperative endeavor of two or more school districts, costs are saved, which permits programs to be offered that may otherwise be too expensive for an individual school to provide. BOCES services a large swath of New Yorkers in many subject areas, from career prep to adult education. As of 2019-2020: 11,675 adult students improved their language comprehension, speaking, and literacy skills through English as a Second Language (ESL) programs at BOCES; 16,670 students' needs were supported in special education classrooms operated by BOCES; and 37,997 students participated in the CTE program to develop college and career-ready skills.

Throughout task force events, participants including students, teachers, superintendents, and even private industry, indicated that BOCES has a reputation of being an educational environment that caters solely to academically challenged students and those with significant behavioral/discipline problems. This bias has resulted in a lack of desire to explore the options BOCES offers because students are afraid of being labeled or looked down on by their peers. It is critical this perception is changed and this stigma is eliminated.

WE NEED TO START SHIFTING
THE CULTURE. IN ORDER TO SHIFT THE
CULTURE YOU HAVE TO SHIFT PERCEPTION
AND YOU HAVE TO CHANGE BEHAVIOR....
SO THAT PEOPLE CAN START TO SEE THAT
THE FUTURE OF WORK, AND THE FUTURE
OF EDUCATION ARE NOT SEPARATE, THEY
ARE TOGETHER." - DR. PATRICIA KILBURN,
DISTRICT SUPERINTENDENT,
ONEIDA BOCES

At the task force event at Mohawk Valley Community College, a 19-year-old man shared his firsthand experience with BOCES. Through one of BOCES' incredible programs, he was able to learn a trade that he has since turned into a career, all the while avoiding the burden of crippling student loan debt. He currently earns \$65,000 a year, while his sister is struggling

⁷ https://www.boces.org/about-boces/

⁸ ibid

⁹ https://www.capitalregionboces.org/infographics/boces-by-the-numbers/; https://www.boces.org/about-boces/

Removing the BOCES Stigma

with an equal amount of debt with no job after graduating from college. Unfortunately, he was unable to avoid facing the stigmas associated with his chosen career pathway. He recalled how even his mother tried to convince him against becoming a CTE student, believing BOCES students were problematic in school – lacking in discipline and struggling academically. Unfortunately, many parents approach CTE programs with equal animosity; however, this man's story is unique in the fact that his mother is a superintendent of schools. While this is but one example, it demonstrates how the stigma has permeated the foundation of our educational structures. To help fight this stigma, stakeholders suggested changing the name of BOCES to encourage students – and parents – to consider this pathway as an option. Fortunately, the Assembly Minority Conference has long supported legislation that would rebrand BOCES as "Career Prep Centers" and provide funding to help make this rebrand a success (A.8320, Barclay). Removing the stigma from BOCES may help increase attendance and assist students who are struggling to find the right balance between academic and career direction.

At various task force events across the State, participants noted the need to introduce CTE programs to students at a younger age. Many who testified provided anecdotes of students who, in the 6th grade and earlier, were already struggling and, with the insistence on

attending college ever present, felt that there was no point in continuing school. Participants "C" suggested perhaps these students could be enopportunity to speak with skilled trades people NIAGARA CAREER & TECHNICAL may help them to better understand how career **EDUCATION CENTER** pathways, other than the standard college track,

gaged through "job fair" days so they could, at FROM ANY SCHOOL EXPERIENCE IN MIDDLE a younger age, meet with industry professionals SCHOOL. THEY DON'T SEE THE RELEVANCE... who have careers in the skilled trades. Provid- UNTIL YOU TIE THAT TO AN INTEREST." ing younger students and their parents with an - LESLIE TANNER, FORMER PRINCIPAL,

can lead to fulfilling and valuable careers. Ultimately, the goal is to increase the overall public appreciation for the skilled trades educational opportunities provided by BOCES at an earlier age.

SOLUTIONS

- > Implement the "Learning for Work K-12 Information Initiative" to introduce ageappropriate CTE programs, and their benefits, to students and parents beginning in elementary school.
- > Develop career open house programs with local businesses to introduce students and parents to the benefits of BOCES, CTE programs, and the correlation to future employment opportunities in their communities.
- > Rebrand BOCES as "Career Prep Centers" and provide funding for marketing efforts and signage replacement (A.8320, Barclay).



ENHANCING THE BOCES EXPERIENCE

While issues related to the stigma of BOCES attendance were of paramount concern to participants, there were also concerns related to improving the overall BOCES experience, including attracting professionals to teach at BOCES, strengthening the cohesion between BOCES districts and their participating school districts, and increasing the availability of BOCES programs to interested students.

A chief concern of many involved with BOCES was attracting competent professionals to the teaching field, which is dually hampered by issues related to State aid calculations and teacher certification. Current State law limits the salaries of CTE teachers, supervisors, and other employees that can be used in calculating State aid. This means that BOCES districts are forced to keep the salaries artificially low to ensure that costs are covered by State aid. Having salaries above this limit would currently require that the BOCES district pick up the additional cost on their own. This unfortunate provision results in significantly lower salaries than the market rate, meaning teachers, supervisors, and other employees are underpaid and likely to look for other employment.

During the forums, stakeholders offered suggestions in relation to teacher certification for skilled trade professionals, including the creation of new teacher certifications for individuals who possess professional "AS FAR AS TRADE TEACHERS ARE CONCERNED, WHEN WE HAVE TO HIRE SOMEBODY THAT IS A VERY DIFFICULT PROCESS. EITHER ONE, THEY DON'T FIT THE CRITERIA OR TWO, WE CAN'T PAY THEM ENOUGH." -

JON SANFRATELLO, DIRECTOR OF INSTRUCTIONAL PROGRAMS, BATAVIA CAREER TECH

skills and extensive experience. Currently, transitional certifications for individuals with professional experience to teach in New York exist, but these certifications require the trained professional to continue their education and take a multitude of coursework over several years to permit them to continue teaching. This long and expensive process can dissuade interested individuals from becoming teachers and using their experience and skills to educate students in their craft. Hypothetically speaking, would a retired electrician pay to go to graduate school to earn a master's degree in education to earn \$30,000 teaching? Establishing new types of certifications to enable skilled professionals to teach while allowing them to avoid the arduous journey of becoming a fully certified teacher would help immensely in getting skilled professionals into the best positons to teach New York's students.

Enhancing the BOCES Experience

Participants also noted problems surrounding the non-uniformity of BOCES districts, and problems created by a lack of cohesion. Each BOCES district is a semi-autonomous unit when it comes to programming and structure. Each district can offer its own set of classes or programs and decide when to allow students to attend BOCES. While on the surface this in-

dependence is positive, potential employers have expressed concerns with legitimacy and across-the-board standards. What one district excels at, another may offer a mediocre version of, and that difference creates doubt surrounding the quality of BOCES programs as

"I DON'T KNOW IF SOMEBODY COMING OUT OF A WELDING PROGRAM AT BOCES IS REALLY GETTING THE SAME EDUCATION AS A WELDER AT A CTE PROGRAM AT A HIGH SCHOOL, AND NEITHER DO OUR EMPLOYERS." – MARTHA PONGE, DIRECTOR OF APPRENTICESHIP FOR MACNY

a whole. Perhaps the implementation of regional advisory boards charged with overseeing the different BOCES districts would ensure they adhere to a uniform curriculum with respect to programs offered and instruction, thereby alleviating prospective employers' fears.

In conjunction with advisory boards to ensure a baseline of credibility across all BO-CES programs, participants referenced a seldom occurring, but significant, problem concerning component school districts not accepting BOCES class credits toward graduation, creating yet another disparity between districts. Occasionally, some school districts may decide that certain BOCES classes do not count toward graduation, when other component school districts, in the same BOCES region, award credit for the same classes. For example, one school might allow their students to use a mechanics course offered at BOCES to fill an elective requirement in order to graduate, but another school in that same BOCES district may require their students to fill all elective course requirements in school rather than allow them to apply a course taken at BOCES. These disparities disadvantage those students who would have taken a particular class, but were unable to as they would not be earning credit toward graduation. Ensuring that all component districts provide credits for the same BOCES classes was supported by those who spoke on the issue. As component districts voluntarily associate to create a BOCES district, it would not be difficult to require that they honor BOCES class credits.

Participants also expressed frustration with the current BOCES timeframe of attendance. Today, students go to school for half the day, take a bus ride ranging from 10 minutes to an hour each way to BOCES, and then receive only two or three hours of education. To help overcome the inadequate amount of instructional time, perhaps full-day BOCES should be an option for students who have met graduation requirements established by the SED. The task force also heard about transportation issues, particularly in rural districts. As mentioned previously, BOCES districts are region-based, meaning most rural counties share one BOCES. The shared services spread over a vast rural area often results in students spending several hours each day in transit to and from BOCES. To increase economic and educational productivity, full-day BOCES attendance, and/or allowing students to be directly transported from their homes to BOCES, or allowing BOCES students to take non-BOCES classes at the BOCES facilities, should be considered.

The COVID-19 pandemic forced schools to close and implement remote learning opportunities for more than a year. While not always ideal, schools and BOCES districts should study the potential positive aspects of remote learning in order to offer additional educational support. Where applicable, utilizing existing resources in schools, including computer labs to

Enhancing the BOCES Experience

simulate hands-on learning programs, could help alleviate time and transportation constraints in certain circumstances dependent on course studies. In areas where BOCES students had experienced difficulties accessing the necessary transportation to attend the programs of their

choice (particularly prepandemic), the State should prioritize expanding reliable broadband or wireless services to provide equal opportunities in every region of New York.

"WEARE ROUGHLY

SO MY JUNIORS ARE ONLY ABLE TO TAKE THREE CLASSES A DAY IN MY BUILDING. IF THEY FAILED A CLASS IN 9TH OR 10TH GRADE, I REALLY CAN'T SEND THEM TO BOCES BECAUSE I WON'T BE ABLE TO GET THEM THE [CLASS TIME] REQUIREMENTS FOR GRADUATION." – VICTOR ZAMPETTI, PRINCIPAL,

MOUNT MARKHAM HIGH SCHOOL

SOLUTIONS

- > Increase the Aidable Salaries of CTE teachers, supervisors, and other employees of a BOCES program that is an approved State expense.
- > Ease restrictions to ensure retired professionals with expertise in a trade or other career field are eligible to teach programs within a school district or BOCES.
- > Ensure all school districts within a BOCES region accept credits in order to satisfy graduation requirements.
- > Provide additional transportation options for students interested in BOCES, including expanding programs within a student's own school to ensure greater access to workbased learning programs.
- > Explore creating "Regional Advisory Boards" between BOCES districts to allow for greater cohesiveness and partnerships.
- > Create a statewide grant program to increase access to additional opportunities when students are denied access to BOCES.
- > Consider implementing full-day BOCES programs.





EXPANDING & ENHANCING P-TECH

Numerous New York school districts offer the New York State Pathways in Technology Early College High School (P-TECH) program, a public-private partnership between high schools, colleges, and businesses designed to graduate high school students with an associate's degree in technological fields. P-TECH is designed to give high school students an opportunity to explore careers centered on the Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics (STEM) fields. As designed, local colleges partner with high schools and businesses to teach students, beginning in 9th grade, and culminating in "grade 14", which includes two years of college level education in their selected field. Classes are often taught by experienced professionals in the relative field of study, and generally contain a practical element, such as working on cars in a mechanics class or coding in computer lab.

P-TECH is an internationally recognized initiative, with programs operating in 23 countries worldwide. In the United States, there are more than 200 P-TECH schools, 41 of which are located in New York.¹⁰ The most recent SED Request for Proposal (RFP) to open new P-TECH schools across New York closed on October 3, 2019.¹¹ This group of proposals will be constructed between 2020 and 2026. SED will accept up to eight RFPs for the construction and operation of new P-TECH programs.¹² As of 2017, P-TECH schools served an estimated 12,000 students in New York,¹³ and enrollment is expected to increase as more programs are opened across the State.

While they are two different educational platforms, in many ways, the issues faced by P-TECH programs are similar to those faced by BOCES. For example, both programs have difficulty recruiting and retaining skilled professionals as teachers, as well as making students and parents aware of the programs' opportunities. While P-TECH does not suffer from the same stigma as BOCES, it does suffer from a general lack of student and parental awareness.

Forum participants suggested P-TECH be introduced earlier in a child's academic career. Career fairs and informational seminars could be offered before students enter high school to increase awareness of the alternative pathways available through P-TECH and BOCES. Expanding awareness and availability of P-TECH prior to 9th grade would help struggling and disinterested students. These changes could prove beneficial to students struggling with

 $^{10\} https://www.ptech.org/about/history/\#:\sim:text=P\%2DTECH\%20 has\%20 now\%20 grown, Taiwan\%2C\%20 with\%20 further\%20 replication\%20 underway$

¹¹ http://www.nysed.gov/postsecondary-services/pathways-technology-nys-p-tech-program

¹² http://www.nysed.gov/common/nysed/files/programs/postsecondary-services/ptech-rfp-cohort5final.docx

¹³ http://www.aypf.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/IBM%E2%80%99s-P-TECH-Data-Overview.pdf

Expanding & Enhancing P-TECH

a traditional academic pathway, and help raise awareness of the career opportunities available through the P-TECH program. Given the importance of New York's P-TECH program

in preparing today's students for tomorrow's workforce, the State must continue to support and promote career pathways which provide students with opportunities including, but not limited to, career ment in a highly-skilled job upon completion of the program.

"WE HAVE WORKED

WITH OUR PARTNERS TO OPEN UP THEIR FACILITIES TO THE COMMUNITY, BECAUSE JUST training, hands-on work, and employ- AS MUCH AS THE STUDENTS DON'T KNOW WHAT IS GOING ON INSIDE THAT BUILDING, PARENTS DON'T KNOW AS WELL." - BRIAN HEFFRON, PRINCIPAL, P-TECH CITI BOCES

Again, similar to BOCES instruction, participants also expressed the need to broaden the types of professionals eligible to instruct P-TECH students. At this time, not every school district has instructors with the SED certifications required to teach P-TECH. In the best interest of the program, perhaps it would be beneficial to create a new teaching certification for industry professionals which would allow them to teach without needing a master's degree in education or a full teaching certificate. Changing the requirements would enable experts in various fields to impart crucial firsthand experience and guidance to students working toward their future careers. Changes of this magnitude could also help bridge a gap both private industry and educational sector stakeholders mentioned during the forums – today's students require more instruction and experience related to soft skills such as punctuality, appropriate attire for interviews and the workplace, and general professional etiquette. It is important to note that these skills are essential for ensuring job placement following graduation from P-TECH programs, and who better to discuss these required skills than a professional in a particular field?

Finally, several participants suggested expanding the State's P-TECH programs to include more than just STEM fields, such as electrical engineering or carpentry. With the expansion, similar to graduating with an associate's degree, students could graduate with a Regent's diploma with an endorsement in electrical engineering or carpentry, followed by the associate's degree. Similar to the current college-business-school partnership that exists in P-TECH, these endorsements, also known as practical credentialing, could be established in collaboration with trade unions or professional organizations. These groups could work to help set the standard for the curriculum to ensure it meets professional requirements, providing legitimacy and credibility to the endorsements, and providing students with multiple pathways to success and varying career opportunities.

SOLUTIONS

- > Establish new types of teaching certifications within the Education Law for specialized instruction to allow highly-skilled individuals to teach their skill or profession in P-TECH or similar schools without being required to earn a master's degree or full teaching certification.
- > Utilize the "Learning for Work K-12 Information Initiative" to provide information via tours, seminars, advertising, parent involvement, and other avenues to students at an earlier age to ensure they are aware of P-TECH and the options available to them regarding the program.

Expanding & Enhancing P-TECH

- > Expand awareness of P-TECH to students prior to 9th grade, and increase the number of available openings for students interested in attending P-TECH.
- > Incorporate professional/soft-skills education as a major component in both P-TECH and general public school education.
- > Create additional graduation pathways with specific endorsements to assist students in finding gainful employment.
- > Continue to support the recognition of workforce-identified credentials and certifications for students enrolled in P-TECH and other educational programs.
- > The State must continue to support and promote P-TECH to provide students with opportunities including, but not limited to, career training, hands-on work, and employment upon completion of the program.





EXPLORING CHANGES IN HIGHER EDUCATION

For countless individuals, higher education provides access to higher paying jobs and successful careers. Statistics continue to show that, on average, those with a college degree earn more than those without one.¹⁴ However, it is also true that there exists a growing misnomer that higher education is the *only* path to a good career. Forum participants were quick to clarify that no one wants to dissuade determined students from pursuing higher education. In fact, discussions were focused around ways to dispel the notion that one can only find career success with a four year degree. In truth, across New York State there are many in-demand, high-value jobs which require less than an associate's degree. Yet, many of these quality jobs go unfilled every year.

New York State has often looked to its higher education institutions to address and improve workforce development needs across the State. In turn, the State's higher education institutions have responded by providing resources and programs that go beyond simply conferring degrees. For example, New York State's SUNY and CUNY community colleges provide numerous workforce development training and education programs, and many of these community colleges have entire offices dedicated to workforce training and continuing education. In addition, New York State has a variety of higher education-related programs that are part of its broader workforce development initiative.

INCREASE THE ABILITY TO PUT PEOPLE IN THE WORKFORCE THEN HELP US GET FUNDING THROUGH SUNY FOR THE NON-CREDIT TYPE OF ACTIVITIES THAT GO ON." - DR. ROBERT NYE. PRESIDENT, FLCC

The following is a brief summary of the various workforce development related funding opportunities awarded to SUNY and CUNY institutions. It is important to note that the 2021-2022 Enacted State Budget provided more than \$1 billion in new capital funding for SUNY and CUNY institutions.

SUNY and CUNY Apprenticeship Programs: This program aims to allow SUNY and CUNY community colleges, in conjunction with the New York State Department of Labor (DOL) and SUNY System Administration, to develop pre-apprentice and Registered

¹⁴ https://www.bls.gov/careeroutlook/2018/data-on-display/education-pays.htm

Exploring Changes in Higher Education

Apprenticeships in high-need fields as identified by the Regional Economic Development Councils. \$3 million is available for SUNY community colleges and \$2 million is available for CUNY community colleges.

SUNY and CUNY Next Generation NY Job Linkage Program: This program offers funding to create or enhance programs that lead to certificate and associate of applied sciences degrees. Eligible programs must have a connection to employer or industry needs that are shown through employer feedback, labor market data, or other evidence of workforce need. \$3 million is available for SUNY community colleges and \$2 million is available for CUNY community colleges.

SUNY and CUNY Community College Contract Courses: This program provides funding for SUNY and CUNY community colleges to offer workforce development and job training programs for businesses or organizations. Projects awarded under this funding may serve a single employer or multiple employers across a specific area. \$1.9 million is available for SUNY community colleges and \$1.88 million is available for CUNY community colleges.

During the six regional task force forums, these programs were highlighted for their role in furthering the State's workforce development strategy. However, some participants voiced concerns that, in general, the many funding opportunities and programs the State offers for workforce development are disorganized and difficult to navigate. The higher education related programs have historically been no exception.

In 2019, the State revamped its application process for these programs by creating a Workforce Development Initiative and a consolidated funding application (CFA). ¹⁵ Reforming the disjointed nature of higher education related workforce development programs and their applications by replacing them with a CFA should be viewed as a positive step toward better workforce development across the State. It is important to note, some of the programs offered by SUNY and CUNY were mentioned by attendees during task force discussions as useful programs, and the increased visibility and accessibility of CFAs should be viewed as encouraging. These programs can better help businesses, employers, and higher education institutions fully utilize them.

Although the applications for these programs were recently consolidated, the criteria on which their success can be judged remains opaque. Currently, recipients of funding from each program are required to submit year-end reporting based on varied metrics. However, the State makes no mention of any report it will be issuing on the new CFA process and its results. Instead, the Office of Workforce Development states that, "Reporting requirements will be comparable to the annual progress report requirements already in place for the REDCs". Without straightforward, comprehensive reporting, it will be difficult to judge the efficacy of the CFA and the various programs encompassed within it. To ensure that Workforce Development Initiative funding is being expended in ways that achieve more positive outcomes at higher education institutions, the State should issue all-encompassing reporting that details how CFA funding is dispersed and with what results.

¹⁵ https://www.governor.ny.gov/news/governor-cuomo-launches-175-million-workforce-development-initiative 16 https://www.ny.gov/sites/ny.gov/files/atoms/files/WORKFORCE_DEVELOPMENT_INITIATIVE2.pdf

Exploring Changes in Higher Education

Beyond the workforce development programs available to SUNY and CUNY institutions, there exist many opportunities for students to gain skills in trades while on college campuses. Despite the fact that college is typically associated with bachelor's degrees, SUNY and CUNY community colleges operate specifically to offer shorter length programs and training designed to meet the immediate needs of local and regional economies. Community colleges around the State have responded to the growing professional-skills gap by offering innovative solutions that are now providing extraordinary opportunities for anyone looking to learn a trade or skill in quickly growing fields.

For example, in early 2019, Hudson Valley Community College (HVCC) opened a \$14.5 million Center for Advanced Manufacturing Skills. 17 The Center boasts a 100% job placement rate for graduates with many employers coming onsite to hire students before they even graduate.¹⁸ HVCC recognized that with 4.6 million available manufacturing jobs over the next decade, filling the professional-skills gap could help connect New Yorkers to high paying manufacturing jobs that many companies are desperate to fill. Another example comes from Rockland County Community College (RCC), which opened its Middle Skills Academy in late 2018. RCC reports, "The Middle Skills Academy was created to give students the chance to earn a certificate that will help them obtain employment quickly. The programs are designed to teach specific skills in a concentrated timeframe so students can start a new career, earning a good salary, in less than one year." Some of the courses offered by RCC's Middle Skills Academy include IT support, CAD drafting, and 3D printing. One final example, from the Capital Region, is the creation of the Capital Community College Career Coalition (C5). Formed in late 2018, C5 is a coalition of Columbia-Greene Community College, Fulton-Montgomery Community College, Hudson Valley Community College, SUNY Adirondack, and SUNY Schenectady County Community College. The aim of C5 is to identify skills gaps and create and strengthen partnerships with businesses, colleges, and workforce development entities.²⁰ According to C5, the "Coalition will work toward developing actionable, sustainable solutions to help grow the supply of potential workers for high-tech industries and other jobs in the region...Our job as community colleges is to recognize that gap, and to work together to educate people for the careers that are out there."

While the examples cited in this report are by no means an exhaustive list of the work-force development initiatives at the State's community colleges, they do indicate community colleges across the State are taking new and creative approaches to addressing the profession-al-skills gap. By working to identify these gaps and creating curricula to fill them, the State's community colleges can play an important role in ensuring that businesses and industries have a skilled workforce, and more New Yorkers have the opportunity to earn higher salaries in growing and important sectors.

Although the higher education sector is predominantly viewed as responsible for preparing future employees, it also plays a role in preparing future educators. At several forums, the task force learned that only two SUNY colleges, Buffalo State College and SUNY Oswego,

¹⁷ https://wnyt.com/news/hvcc-gene-haas-center-for-advanced-manufacturing-skills-opening-/5471272/

¹⁸ https://wnyt.com/news/hvcc-gene-haas-center-for-advanced-manufacturing-skills-opening-/5471272/

¹⁹ http://www.sunyrockland.edu/about/media/news/msa-quickens-path-to-career-success

 $^{20\} https://www.hvcc.edu/about/news/archives/2018/09/capital-region-community-colleges-launch-coalition-in-response-to-workforce-shortage.html$

Exploring Changes in Higher Education

currently offer bachelor's degree programs in Technology Education.²¹ With so few programs to graduate Technology Education teachers, school districts across the State have had difficulty filling these critical positions. In some instances, school districts have had to compete with each other to hire teachers to fill these roles, spending valuable resources that could be invested otherwise for the students within those districts. One suggestion offered by participants was to direct SUNY to expand the number of colleges that offer technology education bachelor's degree programs. Increasing the number of technology education teachers would better enable middle and high schools across the State to staff programs that introduce students to potential technology-related careers.

SOLUTIONS

- > Require the State to issue an annual report on the results of its Workforce Development Initiative CFA process.
- > Increase the number of Technology Education baccalaureate programs offered by SUNY and CUNY institutions.
- > Create more CTE teacher programs at SUNY and CUNY institutions to expand specialized instruction in schools.
- > Enact the Community College Merit and Mobility Scholarship program to incentivize attendance at State Community Colleges.

21 https://www.suny.edu/attend/find-a-suny-program/undergraduate/





REMOVING BUREAUCRATIC BARRIERS

While there currently are State Education Department (SED) programs in place for professional-skills education, such as CTE programs, New York State lacks both a centralized agency to organize and manage CTE and its companion programs, as well as dedicated universal support from SED to expand CTE in school districts across the State. Split between the Department of Labor (DOL) and SED, CTE, apprenticeships, skilled labor experiences, and other programs do not fall under one umbrella. This lack of cohesion results in excessive overlap, program redundancy, and makes it difficult for the average citizen looking to pursue these programs and advance their education into the professional-skills market. It also has made navigating apprenticeship programs difficult on local businesses. In fact, a survey by the New York Association of Training and Employment Professionals (NYATEP) showed that only 11 out of 170 businesses that responded utilized the apprenticeship program, and that 60% of the businesses who do not use New York State's apprenticeship program found navigating the regulations very challenging or challenging.²² This needs to change.

Current work-based learning programs are technically available to every school in the State, but offered at relatively fied teachers with a wide array of experience qualifications is not an easy or simple proschool districts. With a lack of qualified edu- LIMITED BASIS." – MARK CUSHMAN, cators, a school district is often unable to offer a CTE program. If a district is unable to **INSTRUMENT SALES** offer the program, its students would have to

IFORTUNATELY.

few. These programs require specially-certi- THROUGH NO FAULT OF THEIR OWN, HOW MANY [TEACHERS] HAVE EXPERIENCED PRIVATE and education. Finding teachers with these INDUSTRY? FEW, YET WE ARE EXPECTING THEM TO REINFORCE THE THINGS THAT INDUSTRY cedure, especially for more rural or secluded WANTS TO SHOW, OR EXPOSE, [STUDENTS] ON A VP ORGANIZATIONAL DEVELOPMENT, FIBER

travel to their area BOCES, risk incurring the associated stigma, and endure travel time and any associated interruption to their in-school education. This assumes, however, that their area BOCES has enough free seats to include them, that it offers the program(s) they are seeking, and that the student is willing, and able, to commit to such a drastic change in their educational atmosphere and routine.

²² https://docs.wixstatic.com/ugd/dd664a_2057caf3afa549f2bdd20107dff68b9a.pdf

Removing Bureaucratic Barriers

Increasing dedicated SED support to expand CTE programs would assist greatly in educating students in the most productive manner in order to fill the professional-skills gap. Unifying the entire CTE process, specifically the apprenticeship and labor aspects of the education pathway under one State-level agency, would allow for a more streamlined and organized process for students, teachers, and parents to get the most out of CTE and similar programs. Assigning responsibility for CTE to a single agency would also help address the concerns of employers regarding inconsistent standards between current CTE programs. Furthermore, unified and transparent administration of the program would be immensely valuable for students, employers, and in the long run, the State economy.

One particular point met with near-universal support at the various forums included the creation of a special teaching license to allow skilled-trades professionals to teach without the need for a master's degree. Finding an individual who has both the technical skills and experience in combination with a teaching degree is difficult in populated areas, let alone rural upstate. Creating a license, administered by SED and applied statewide, which would allow master technicians to teach classes on their subject, would alleviate this burden. A license of this sort would allow for a massive expansion of CTE-type programs statewide, all governed by SED, addressing both the shortfall in the number of instructors and the uncertainty held by employers across the State.

In addition to SED support of statewide standards for CTE programs, grants and scholarships should be offered to participating students to assist them in their apprenticeships and work experiences. Several speakers noted the financial cost associated with the type of labor CTE students may encounter. Work boots, gloves, heavy outerwear, safety equipment, etc. are expensive and wear-heavy items that require regular replacement and upgrading. Reducing the cost to students would help to increase the number of students, particularly lower-income students, available to participate in these programs and develop their future career. Having the assurance the State would provide or assist in (i.e. tax credit or reimbursement) the purchase of education-related materials would be a great reassurance to students, and would further demonstrate SED's support of CTE and similar programs.

Another issue raised at the forums included the necessity of adopting and mandating a nationally recognized standardized assessment of skills. Implementation of such would help to ensure the State's apprenticeship programs were more attractive to New York State residents and, potentially, out-of-state residents.

"THE PACE IS CHANGING RAPIDLY, THE VOID IS COMING QUICKLY. WE ARE BEHIND IN RECRUITING SKILLED TRADES, WE ARE BEHIND IN RECRUITING THE HOURLY WORKFORCE AND WE ARE BEHIND GETTING THEM EDUCATED AND UP TO SPEED." - KEVIN HOYT, SENIOR DIRECTOR OF OPERATIONS, NEW YORK AIR BRAKE

For example, in the heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) field there is the Industry Competency Exam (ICE), which is an entry-level exam that is supported and validated by the major industry associations. For Certified Nursing Assistants, there is the Certified Nursing Assistant Examination with both a written examination and a clinical skills test. For Licensed Practical Nurses or Licensed Vocational Nurses, there is the National Council

Removing Bureaucratic Barriers

Licensure Examination-Practical Nursing (NCLEX PN) test. By mandating that the State Apprenticeship Training Council, and other State institutions charged with overseeing apprenticeship programs, require the administration of a nationally-recognized standardized assessment of skills as a condition of graduation, the State would be viewed as a leader in promoting uniformity of national standards. This uniformity would also better prepare those enrolled in apprenticeship programs for the realities of vocational training and the 21st Century workforce.

Knowing that any skills, training, or programs attended are applicable nationally would make them more attractive to New York State residents and, if marketed successfully, to interested parties out of state. This would go a long way toward not only attracting people and businesses back to New York State in general, but perhaps serve as an added incentive that would prevent them from leaving in the first place. It would also prove useful in attracting out-of-state residents or businesses, specifically to areas where population decline is a persistent problem and concerning in terms of regional long-term growth. A skilled workforce is the backbone of any company's success and any region's economic sustainability and viability.

The issue of overly restrictive DOL labor laws and their detrimental effect on local apprenticeship programs emerged at numerous regional forums. Local and regional apprenticeship programs in some areas of New York State are primarily focused on heavy industry, and as such, industry partners cautiously conform to the Labor Law to avoid and minimize liability and repercussions from DOL. Article 23, Subsection 815 of the Labor Law specifically states "apprentices shall be not less than sixteen years of age," and this has created a situation where industry partners are forced to create overly restrictive programs in terms of hands-on training in order to conform to the Labor Law.

As mentioned previously, in order to ensure the students' and programs' success, it is critical that students interested in apprenticeship programs, and considering the trades as a vocation, should be exposed to them early in their educational development. Early exposure would allow them to develop vocational skills in tandem with educational skills, providing them with a solid foundation in both classroom- and apprenticeship-based educational development. As currently written, the section of Labor Law pertaining to youth apprenticeships may hinder earlier exposure to apprenticeship programs and trade-based vocations.

In addition, students interested in apprenticeship programs should be exposed in a hands-on fashion so they gain familiarization with the tools of the trade, the reality of the work, and the machinery used. For many of the students interested in apprenticeship programs, this is precisely the attraction of the programs. In a hands-on capacity, students are able to learn in a direct fashion, in real-world conditions, while receiving demonstrated instruction of how to successfully complete a job. It is counterproductive, both for the students and for the apprenticeship programs, to channel this drive for hands-on training and on-the-job instruction into a restrictive, primarily *classroom-focused* setting when the students pursuing these programs were seeking an alternative to that particular environment from the start.

Legislative solutions to these challenges must address these contradictions between the practical conditions of apprenticeship programs and DOL's labor laws. Legislative action to increase the effectiveness and participation in local and regional apprenticeship programs should seek to clarify the Labor Law with regard to such programs in one of two ways. First, enact

Removing Bureaucratic Barriers

legislation that provides an age exemption for apprenticeship programs. This exemption would have a significant, positive impact on these programs, allowing them to be tailored to expose students to on-the-job, direct instruction in a regulated, supervised environment without the preconditions of an overly cautious interpretation of, and adherence to, the labor laws. This option would also maintain the integrity of the State's enforcement of those laws while recognizing the inherent nature of hands-on apprenticeship program training. Secondly, the labor laws should be amended, adjusted, and/or updated to reflect the needs of current apprenticeship programs; there should not be a blanket exemption from DOL enforcement. This would have the same positive effect as the exemption option with regard to apprenticeship programs while including the added benefit of clarifying the State's labor laws in relation to apprenticeship programs, and the need to start such programs earlier in students' educational development.

Finally, in general, participants noted that it is incredibly difficult to find comprehensive information regarding apprenticeship programs, regardless of whether you are an individual seeking more information about available opportunities (students) or an entity looking to create such a program (employer).

SOLUTIONS

- > Clarify Department of Labor rules regarding youth apprenticeship programs in the workplace.
- > Consolidate the operations of DOL and SED with relation to CTE and apprenticeship programs into one entity that includes apprenticeship navigators to help businesses and aspiring apprentices successfully implement or complete work-based learning programs.
- > Create an easy-to-navigate, centralized website that would include all information related to apprenticeship programs in New York State, specifically information for:
 - New Yorkers interested in becoming apprentices,
 - Employers looking for information to start a program,
 - Educational institutions looking to start a program, and
 - Any other relevant information.
- > Ease and standardize the certification process to allow greater flexibility for local school districts interested in creating their own programs.
- > Create grants or scholarship programs for CTE students who need physical equipment for their apprenticeships and/or work-based learning experiences.
- > Adopt a nationally-recognized standardized assessment of skills.



LEARNING FOR WORK LEGISLATIVE CHANGES

When first drafted, the Assembly Minority Learning for Work Act was intended to highlight the importance of work-based learning for training the future New York workforce. The following is a brief breakdown of the three-part program:

CURRENT LEARNING FOR WORK PROGRAM

- > Youth Apprenticeship Program: Creates a one- or two-year program beginning in 11th or 12th grade that combines academic classroom coursework in a student's home district with mentored on-the-job (and on-site) training in a specific occupational area.
 - At least 50% of the students participating in the program must be offered employment by the employer that offers the on-the-job training.
 - Any student who is not offered, or who decides not to seek, employment in their field of choice will be awarded a minimum of 15 credit hours at any SUNY or CUNY institution.
- > Enhanced Regents Professional Degree: Students enrolled in the Youth Apprenticeship Program will earn this degree with a specific designation denoting the skills and specific occupational training obtained in their career field of choice.
- > Youth Apprenticeship Tax Credit: Establishes a \$1,500 per apprentice tax credit for businesses that take part in the Youth Apprenticeship Program (A.8426, Walczyk).

The intention of the Learning for Work Program is not to replace BOCES, but rather supplement existing BOCES programs and other work-based learning programs that provide valuable benefits to participating students. The Learning for Work Program provides students with another pathway to receive career training without the unfortunate stigma that is sometimes associated with attending BOCES programs.

Stakeholders from around the State spoke about the importance of learning from local businesses, school districts, existing BOCES, and other apprenticeship programs in order to better understand the impact of the professional-skills gap on New York's businesses, workforce, and communities. Throughout the forums, the task force received suggestions on what could be done to enhance the existing legislation in order to make the current Learning for Work Program something students and employers would feel motivated to participate in.

Learning for Work Legislative Changes

During the task force event in Rochester, for example, a stakeholder emphasized that developing students' trades skills and future college participation are not mutually exclusive. As students participate in various CTE programs throughout the State, some will discover their apprenticeship programs and subsequent job training might be enough to attain their career goals. However, others will discover that their training will spark an ambition to further their education. A likely scenario for the improvement and expansion of the Learning for Work Program may include the application of appropriate college credit for skills learned during an apprenticeship program should the student wish to pursue post-secondary schooling.

A tenet of the current Learning for Work Program requires that at least 50% of the students participating in the program be offered employment by the employer that offers the onthe-job training. Unfortunately, the task force learned at the forums that this is a rather vague requirement when applied to real-world scenarios. Language in the legislation must stipulate whether the employer needs to maintain part-time or full-time employees when hiring workers from the Learning for Work Program. As a result, the legislation has been modified to require at least 50% of participating students be offered full-time employment by the training employer.

At the forums, stakeholders conveyed that students who might benefit from a CTE program were often unable to attend BOCES due to academic shortcomings. To help alleviate some of these obstacles, and to help our future workforce, BOCES should be allowed to participate in a local partnership included in the Learning for Work Program. Based on this feedback, this issue was remedied in the latest version of Assembly Minority Conference legislation.

Along these lines, it is also important to address the factors that tend to keep some students from participating in a meaningful way with partnering businesses in their communities. Students fill varying socioeconomic needs and therefore may require assistance with transportation, equipment, or even uniforms. Ensuring the Learning for Work Program and all apprenticeship programs throughout the State are appropriately funded and administered is paramount to the success of educating students in trade skills.

SOLUTIONS

- > Automatically grant college credits to a student in their specific apprenticeship discipline.
- > Specify the expectations for teaching professional/soft skills in any youth apprenticeship program.
- > Add BOCES to entities eligible to take part in a local partnership.
- > Ensure students of all socioeconomic backgrounds are able to participate in the local youth apprenticeship program by providing funding for transportation, equipment, or any other materials.
- > Allow for participation in programs beginning in a student's 9th grade year.
- > Specify employer obligations for hiring students upon successful completion of a youth apprenticeship program.



TASK FORCE RECOMMENDATIONS & SOLUTIONS

During the fall of 2019, the Assembly Minority Task Force on Learning for Work hosted a series of six regional forums to gain insight from members of the public as well as educational, trade, and industrial leaders about the economic and educational impact of the Learning for Work Program. The state's economic health, viability, and competitiveness depend on a well-trained, skilled workforce. The following solutions were developed based on input from stakeholders interested in educating a workforce prepared for the modern economy.

REMOVING THE BOCES STIGMA

- > Implement the "Learning for Work K-12 Information Initiative" to introduce ageappropriate CTE programs, and their benefits, to students and parents beginning in elementary school.
- > Develop career open house programs with local businesses to introduce students and parents to the benefits of BOCES, CTE programs, and the correlation to future employment opportunities in their communities.
- > Rebrand BOCES as Career Prep Centers and provide funding for marketing and signage replacement (A.8320, Barclay).

ENHANCING THE BOCES EXPERIENCE

- > Increase the Aidable Salaries of CTE teachers, supervisors, and other employees of a BOCES program that is an approved State expense.
- > Ease restrictions to ensure retired professionals with expertise in a trade or other career field are eligible to teach programs within a school district or BOCES.
- > Ensure all school districts within a BOCES region accept credits in order to satisfy graduation requirements.
- > Provide additional transportation options for students interested in BOCES, including expanding programs within a student's own school to ensure greater access to workbased learning programs.

Task Force Recommendations & Solutions

- > Explore creating "Regional Advisory Boards" between BOCES districts to allow for greater cohesiveness and partnerships.
- > Create a statewide grant program to increase access to additional opportunities when students are denied access to BOCES.
- > Consider implementing full-day BOCES programs.

EXPANDING AND ENHANCING P-TECH

- > Establish new types of teaching certifications within the Education Law for specialized instruction to allow highly-skilled individuals to teach their skill or profession in P-TECH or similar schools without being required to earn a master's degree or full teaching certification.
- > Utilize the "Learning for Work K-12 Information Initiative" to provide information via tours, seminars, advertising, parent involvement, and other avenues to students at an earlier age to ensure they are aware of P-TECH and the options available to them regarding the program.
- > Expand awareness of P-TECH to students prior to 9th grade, and increase the number of available openings for students interested in attending P-TECH.
- > Incorporate professional/soft-skills education as a major component in both P-TECH and general public school education.
- > Create additional graduation pathways with specific endorsements to assist students in finding gainful employment.
- > Continue to support the recognition of workforce-identified credentials and certifications for students enrolled in P-TECH and other educational programs.
- > The State must continue to support and promote P-TECH to provide students with opportunities including, but not limited to, career training, hands-on work, and employment upon completion of the program.

EXPLORING CHANGES IN HIGHER EDUCATION

- > Require the State to issue an annual report on the results of its Workforce Development Initiative CFA process.
- > Increase the number of Technology Education baccalaureate programs offered by SUNY and CUNY institutions.
- > Create more CTE teacher programs at SUNY and CUNY institutions to expand specialized instruction in schools.
- > Enact the Community College Merit and Mobility Scholarship program to incentivize attendance at State Community Colleges.

Task Force Recommendations & Solutions

REMOVING BUREAUCRATIC BARRIERS

- > Clarify Department of Labor rules regarding youth apprenticeship programs in the workplace.
- > Consolidate the operations of DOL and SED with relation to CTE and apprenticeship programs into one entity that includes apprenticeship navigators to help businesses and aspiring apprentices successfully implement or complete work-based learning programs.
- > Create an easy-to-navigate, centralized website that would include all information related to apprenticeship programs in New York State, specifically information for:
 - New Yorkers interested in becoming apprentices;
 - Employers looking for information to start a program;
 - Educational institutions looking to start a program; and
 - Any other relevant information.
- > Ease and standardize the certification process to allow greater flexibility for local school districts interested in creating their own programs.
- > Create grants or scholarship programs for CTE students who need physical equipment for their apprenticeships and/or work-based learning experiences.
- > Adopt a nationally-recognized standardized assessment of skills.

LEARNING FOR WORK LEGISLATIVE CHANGES

- > Automatically grant college credits to a student in their specific apprenticeship discipline.
- > Specify the expectations for teaching professional/soft skills in any youth apprenticeship program.
- > Add BOCES to entities eligible to take part in a local partnership.
- > Ensure students of all socioeconomic backgrounds are able to participate in the local youth apprenticeship program by providing funding for transportation, equipment, or any other materials.
- > Allow for participation in programs beginning in a student's 9th grade year.
- > Specify employer obligations for hiring students upon successful completion of a youth apprenticeship program.





TASK FORCE EVENTS

Western New York - October 15, 2019; 6-8 p.m.

Assembly Members Angelo Morinello, Steve Hawley, and Andy Goodell with Co-Chairs Ken Blankenbush and Mike Norris

Location: Orleans Niagara BOCES, Niagara Career & Technical Education Center, 3181 Saunders Settlement Road, Sanborn, NY 14132

Central New York - October 22, 2019; 6-8 p.m.

Assembly Members Brian Miller, John Salka, and Robert Smullen with Co-Chairs Ken Blankenbush and Mike Norris

Location: Mohawk Valley Community College, Utica Campus, Alumni College Center, Rm. 116, 1101 Sherman Drive, Utica, NY 13501

North Country - October 23, 2019; 6-8 p.m.

Assembly Members Will Barclay and Mark Walcyzk with Co-Chairs Ken Blankenbush and Mike Norris

Location: Lewis County Jefferson Community College Education Center, 7395 E Road, Lowville, NY 13367

Capital Region - November 12, 2019; 6-8 p.m.

Assembly Members Mary Beth Walsh, Jake Ashby, and Kevin Byrne with Co-Chairs Ken Blankenbush and Mike Norris

Location: Town of Ballston Community Room, 323 Charlton Road, Ballston Spa, NY 12020

Nassau County - November 13, 2019; 6-8 p.m.

Assembly Members Ed Ra, Dave McDonough, Michael Montesano, and John Mikulin with Co-Chairs Ken Blankenbush and Mike Norris

Location: Nassau Community College (Tower T, 11th Floor), 1 Education Drive, Garden City, NY 11530

Rochester - November 14, 2019; 6-8 p.m.

Assembly Members Steve Hawley, Marjorie Byrnes, and Brian Manktelow with Co-Chairs Ken Blankenbush and Mike Norris

Location: Monroe Community College, Downtown Rochester Campus (High Falls Conf. Room), 321 State Street, Rochester, NY 14608